Care:

A Sustainable (or, at least, relevant) Ethic?

Lauren Holahan, MS, OT/L NC DPI Consultant for Occupational Therapy & Medicaid UNC-Chapel Hill Division of Occupational Science

Objectives

- Understand revisions to AOTA Code of Ethics (2010)
- Analyze the theoretical foundation of the AOTA Code of Ethics
- Understand fundamental aspects of ethics of care
- Evaluate AOTA Code of Ethics in light of ethics of care
- Apply ethics of care to OT workplace ethical dilemma

Write It Down

List 5 things that are important to you...



...at work.

AOTA Code of Ethics, 2010

History
Development
Values
Principles
Philosophical base



AOTA Code of Ethics - History

• First codified in 1977

• Revisions in 1979, 1988, 1994, and 2005

- Complimentary documents
 - Core Values and Attitudes (1993)
 - Guidelines to the AOTA Code of Ethics (1998)

AOTA Code of Ethics -Development

• 2010 edition combines 3 previous documents

- Compiled review of:
 - Issues raised in OT ethics cases
 - Member questions related to ethics
 - Content of other professional codes of ethics

• Based on:

- Ethical reasoning
- Empathic reflection

AOTA Code of Ethics - Values

Justice
Freedom
Altruism
Prudence
Equality
Truth
Dignity



Write It Down

List 5 things that make a difference in your life...



...at work.

AOTA Code of Ethics -Principles

• Beneficence

- Nonmaleficence
- Autonomy and confidentiality
- Social justice
- Procedural justice
- Veracity
- Fidelity

AOTA Code of Ethics – Theoretical Foundation



Principlism

• Lack a unifying theoretical base:

- Anthological, ad hoc origin
- Which, if any, has priority?
- How do they relate?
- Function as reminders of ethical value, but provide no action guide

(Clouser, 1995)

In Search of an Ethical Framework for Occupational Therapy and Science

• Something more:

- o unified and systematic?
- suitable than a biomedical perspective?
- publicly understood and accepted?
- daily, relevant, and practicable?
- reliable and reasoned?
- Something allowing analysis?
- Something providing a guide for action?
- Something that articulates with the culture of OT?

Write It Down List 5 things you identify yourself with...



...at work.

Ethics of Care

History
Development
Assumptions
"Rules"



Ethics of Care – History and Development



- Moral sentimentalism
- In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development (Gilligan, 1982)
- Education (Noddings)
- Philosophy (Frankfurt, Slote)
- Nursing (Benner, Gordon)
- Political Science (Tronto)

Assumptions

- Humans are dependent for many years of their lives
- Those dependent on us have a moral claim on us
- Developing relationships of care is moral territory; caring relations are morally superior to other forms of relatedness
- Human progress hinges on the care that those needing it receive

(Held, 2006' Noddings, 2004)

Rules of Common Morality

- Don't cause pain, harm, or death
- Don't deprive freedom
- Don't cheat
- Don't steal
- o Don't lie
- Don't break promises



(Clouser, 1995)

"Rules" of an Ethic of Care

- Go out of your way to be helpful
- Help who you can, when you can, to the extent your can
 - Pay attention, cultivate sensitivity
 - Weigh (think) the impulse (feel)
 - Enter in; empathize; connect
 - Respond; place the needs of others before your own
 - Assess the relationship
- Do your duty—persistently
- Have a vision



Write It Down List 5 things you are devoted to...



...at work.

Analysis and Procedure: Guidance for Exceptions and Violations of Rules

- Would the action be justified for all people in the same morally relevant circumstance?
- Would the action be permissible if everyone knew it was permitted?
- Does the harm prevented outweigh the harm caused?

(Clouser, 1995)

Occupational Justice...

- People have a right to participate in meaningful occupations
- Matters of health are matters of justice; we are a justice-driven profession
- Equitable distribution of access to occupations

(Wilcock, 1998)

...or, occupational care?

Whoa, Whoa, Whoa!

• Caring is stressful

- Coping with the stress of caring without detaching:
 - Assume caring is primary
 - Assume a certain level of involvement provides insight
 - Acknowledge disability and dependence are real
 - Decide to offer help without dictating outcome
 - Recognize multiple contributions (Benner, 1988)



Sustainable?

- "Just right" care:
 - the least possible contribution with the best chance of making a difference
 - doing a little beyond the ordinary
 - A series of small contributions that yield something substantial over time
- Burnout ≠ caring too much

AOTA Code of Ethics & Ethics of Care

- Which strand of ethics seems to align best with the tenets of our profession and practice?
- Write Principle 8 and sample evidences from an ethics of care perspective.

References

- Benner, P., & Wrubel, J. (1988). Caring comes first. The American Journal of Nursing, 88, 1072-1075.
- Clouser, K.D. (1995). Common morality as an alternative to principlism. Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal, 5, 219-236.
- Fed Regist. 1979 Apr 18;44(76):23192-7. Protection of human subjects: Belmont Report--ethical principles and guidelines for the protection of human subjects of research. U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. Publication Types: * Government Publications PMID: 11645399 [PubMed - indexed for MEDLINE] Retrieved 10/19/2010 from http://ohsr.od.nih.gov/guidelines/belmont.html
- Frankfurt, H. (1998). The Importance of What We Care About. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Gillgan, C. (1982). In a Different Voice. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University press.
- Gordon, S., Benner, P., and Noddings, N. (1996). Caregiving. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Held, V. (2006). The Ethics of Care. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Noddings, N. (1984) Caring. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Slote, M. (2007). The Ethics of Care and Empathy. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Wilcock, A., & Townsend, E. (2003). Occupational Justice. In Crepeau, E., Cohn, E., & Schell, B. (Eds.), Willard and Spackman's Occupational Therapy (192-199). Baltimore, MD: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.